



Design Review Board

**Tuesday, July 9, 2019
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM**

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson
Vice Chair J. Seth Placko
Boardmember Sean Banda
Boardmember Randy Carter
Boardmember Scott Thomas
Boardmember Tanner Green

Board Members Absent:

Boardmember Jeanette Knudsen

Staff Present:

Nana Appiah, PhD, AICP, Planning Director
Lesley Davis, Senior Planner
Heather Omta, Planning Assistant
Lisa Davis, AICP, Planner II
Ryan McCann, Planner I
Cassidy Welch, Planner I
Rachel Prelog, Senior Planner
Wahid Alam, AICP, Planner II

Others Present:

Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

Item A.1.

DRB19-00306

Within the 200 through 300 blocks of South Extension Road

Location: Located north of Broadway Road, east of Alma School Road. (5.3 ± acres)

Request: Review of approximately 20,000 SQFT warehouse addition to an existing development

Applicant: Jared Hare, Hare Holdings LLC

Staff Planner: Ryan McCann, Planner I

Council District: 4

- ❖ Staff Planner, Ryan McCann, presented the new warehouse project. He explained that the warehouse is not for public use. He stated that staff was looking for input on the color palette, landscape design and species, and building materials.

- ❖ Applicant: Greg Fouts, 308 S Extension Road represented the case. He noted that he is the applicant and owner. He said they intend to paint all the buildings on the campus to match the color board submitted with the dark grey, black and red stripe. He noted he also intends to paint the new fence and will remove the chain link fence. The applicant shared renderings and explained that there are two textures though both are metal. He also stated the color palette fits in to the industrial area. He is leery of reducing parking to increase landscape areas since he needs parking for 130+ employees. The new warehouse will store finished goods and will be cooled by evaporation coolers.

- ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson:
 - Colors are acceptable
 - Likes the logo
 - Use of materials acceptable
 - Color all buildings to be cohesive
 - Doesn't mind the red color because it is in an industrial area
 - Other materials could be embossed metal material
 - Recommends using textured block in the fencing
 - Likes the look of the gate
 - Haven't met two material standards, need to meet
 - Recommends use of another material at the base of the wall
 - Improve the landscape around the outside wall

- ❖ Boardmember Randy Carter:
 - Doesn't think this project meets two of four material standards (3 materials, changes to parapet, dimension, to meet codes for general industrial zoning)
 - Not in favor of the color palette or using over the entire campus
 - Likes the logo
 - Recommends improving the building design
 - Suggests lighter grey to be harmonious with the neighborhood
 - Proportions of colors are too heavy
 - Needs another material to meet the code

- ❖ Boardmember Sean Banda comments:
 - Two materials are essential
 - Add landscaping
 - Dress up the CMU exterior wall
 - Upgrade lighting
 - Landscape improvement where visible to public
 - Check with SRP forestry division on tree choices (powerlines in the area)
 - Likes the grass
 - Metal building acceptable
 - Modernizes the area

- ❖ Vice Chair J. Seth Placko:
 - Limited on what can be done with landscaping with small growing areas
 - Need a small skinny tree that grows in grass
 - Suggests Bottle trees, Ficus trees fit the character
 - Likes the grass
 - Refresh foundation plantings

Item A.2.

DRB19-00362 Within the 5500 block of South Sossaman Road
Location: Located south of East Ray Road, east of Power Road. (13 ± acres)
Request: Review of three new hangars at Mesa Gateway
Applicant: Bob Winton, Winton Architects
Staff Planner: Wahid Alam, AICP, Planner II
Council District: 6

- ❖ Staff Planner, Wahid Alam, presented the case for the proposed hangar buildings.
- ❖ Steven Brown with Sunstate Builders, 1050 W. Washington St., #214, Tempe, AZ: this is a phased project. Hangar C is the first phase, hangar A and B will be completed phase two. Hangar C could be 4 separate hangars, designed for larger aircraft. Hangar A and B are smaller hangars. There will be an office area for each hangar and a vehicle door for each hangar and future fueling operation for Hangar B. Taxi way access on SE side of the parcel to access the hangars.
- ❖ Boardmember Sean Banda:
 - The area has some modern buildings
 - Likes the colors
 - Building design is dated and looks heavy
 - Lacks modern appeal
 - Feels like a warehouse
- ❖ Vice Chair J. Seth Placko:
 - Plantings along Hangar C: plantings are small (Texas Mountain Laurel)
 - Looking for taller plants and trees
 - North side of Hangar B has wasted landscape area
 - Desert Museum Palo Verde primary tree species; add in other species
 - Desert Museum Palo Verde are top heavy, mix in other species to offset potential storm damage to the whole grouping of Palo Verde
- ❖ Boardmember Scott Thomas:
 - Likes color palette
 - Awning seems small
 - Building design is ordinary
 - Need height in the columns
 - Very linear

- ❖ Boardmember Randy Carter:
 - Color matches surrounding buildings; color should vary from other building colors
 - Would like to see a unique design
 - Building feels dated and unoriginal
 - Likes the fin, wants to see it more exaggerated
 - Recommends an alternate color to the “blue”; possibly a different color, shade, and/ or material
 - Entry could use design change; accentuate entries

- ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson:
 - Express more angulation in the building design
 - Wants to see more variation in materials, colors, and building; including entrances

- ❖ Boardmember Tanner Green:
 - Hangar C not the predominate building from the road
 - Very geometric
 - Add some interest on fins (larger, more emphasized)
 - Hangars A & B sides are very visible to traffic, should have design interesting elements

Item A.3.

DRB19-00363 Within the 9600 block of East Hampton Avenue.
Location: Located south of Southern Avenue on the west side of Crismon Road. (3.8 ± acres)
Request: Review new multiple residence development
Applicant: Brennan Ray, Burch & Curacchiolo, P.A.
Staff Planner: Cassidy Welch, Planner I
Council District: 6

- ❖ Staff Planner, Cassidy Welch, presented the case for the proposed multi residence casitas. She explained that this project will be a companion development to a neighboring rental casita development. She explained that there are minor modifications to the elevations with modified roof styles. She said staff is looking for recommendations on the elevations for the visible sides of the garages.
- ❖ Applicant Brennan Ray, 708 E Osborne Rd #200, Phoenix, AZ: gave the history of the site and explained why they changed the roof. He said there were challenges with installing the foam on the flat roof on the first phase of development, so they changed to gable roofs.
- ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson:
 - Approves of the gate
 - Likes the sign
 - Add fascia to enhance aesthetics of the carport
 - Match color of metal on carport roof to match the units
 - Likes garage doors
- ❖ Boardmember Scott Thomas:
 - Likes the pitched gable roof
- ❖ Boardmember Tanner Green:
 - Likes the material choice on gate
 - Noticed the black gate where other places it was bronze everywhere else
 - Add wainscoting on garage rear that is facing the walk
 - Opening gate could be more cohesive
- ❖ Boardmember Randy Carter:
 - Doors on the ends of one-bedroom units, towers too tall.
 - Amount of material changes make it seem cut up
 - Cautions what is visible from Hampton
 - Proportions of guard towers look strange
- ❖ Vice Chair J. Seth Placko:
 - Likes the plant palette, likes the use of Mastic tree
 - Adjust plant sizes where space is an issue
 - Tree around trash enclosure may have a canopy issue with Solid Waste vehicles
 - Cautions using Oak trees around parking spaces due to sap droppings

Item A.4.

DRB19-00394

2659 West Guadalupe Road

Location:

Located on the Southeast corner of West Guadalupe Road and South Carriage Lane.
(1.19 ± acres).

Request:

Review of a Convenience store, gas station and drive thru Coffee shop.

Applicant:

Angie Grendahl, Thompson Thrift Retail Group

Staff Planner:

Wahid Alam, Planner II

Council District:

3

Continued to the August 13, 2019 Design Review meeting

Item A.5.

DRB19-00405

Within the 6000 through 6300 blocks of South Power Road

Location:

Located south of Williams Field Road between the northbound and southbound lanes of Power Road. (10 ± acres)

Request:

Review of a multiple residence development.

Applicant:

Sean Lake, Pew and Lake, PLC

Staff Planner:

Cassidy Welch, Planner I

Council District:

6

- ❖ Staff Planner, Cassidy Welch, presented the case for the proposed multi residence project. She described the project and stated that staff did not have any concerns with the proposed elevations or landscape plan.
- ❖ Sean Lake, Pew and Lake, PLC, 1744 S Val Vista Dr #217 Mesa, AZ represented the project along with the developer and design team. The team described how the development fits this unusual parcel. He reviewed the layout and how the residential will blend into commercial at the southern portion of the parcel. He said they are working with City of Mesa and Gilbert on traffic and pedestrian circulation. They used a simple palette with timeless colors and patterned stucco. They are also creating architectural shading with thicker foam in areas. The team described how the design helps to create a community feel that comes together in the different gardens throughout the development.
- ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson:
 - Add shade fin to top floor (3rd story) to help create shade on exterior
 - 1st and 2nd floors will get shade from trees
- ❖ Boardmember Sean Banda:
 - Hasn't seen raked stucco
 - Excited about the concept and design
 - Retro yet modern design
 - Likes the outdoor space design
- ❖ Boardmember Randy Carter:
 - Noticed no sun protection over main window elevations, only corners
 - Recommends window shading on third story windows, trees will shade lower levels
 - Overall a very nice project
- ❖ Boardmember Tanner Green:
 - Concerned about mechanicals and noise
 - Requested clarification on whether they are using lap siding
 - Asked applicant to clarify weathered versus painted materials on gates and fencing
 - Need cohesiveness in materials used throughout the project
- ❖ Vice Chair J. Seth Placko:
 - Cautions using spinney plants in pedestrian paths

Item A.6.

DRB19-00441 1253 South Gilbert Road
Location: Located south of Southern Avenue on the east side of Gilbert Road. (1.4 ± acres).
Request: Review of redesign of an existing bank building.
Applicant: Dane Brubacker, Mittelstaedt Cooper & Associates Ltd.
Staff Planner: Cassidy Welch, Planner I
Council District: 3

- ❖ Staff Planner, Cassidy Welch, presented the case for the proposed redesign of an existing Credit Union building. She stated that staff did not have any concerns and welcomed the modern update to an existing building.
- ❖ Applicant: Dane Brubaker with Mittelstaedt Cooper & Associates, Ltd. 4130 E Van Vuren Stre, #200, Phoenix, AZ, represented the case.
- ❖ Boardmember Randy Carter:
 - Signage should be placed over entry, not offset
- ❖ Boardmember Sean Banda:
 - Signage over parapet looks awkward where it rises above roofline
 - Wall packs are heavy
 - Advises looking at different lighting for the backside of the building
- ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson:
 - Black tile / pavers will be hot in the summer and show gum, dirt, and debris
 - Hard to tell where the entrance is with signage placement and no clear paver path
 - Likes the green and orange plants in the rendering, suggest color pops in landscape
- ❖ Vice Chair J. Seth Placko:
 - Swain Hill is a true fruitless olive tree, other olives species will take maintenance
 - Need larger planter for trees
 - Increase the size of islands to sustain plant / tree life
 - Plenty of room to expand planter sizes
- ❖ Boardmember Tanner Green:
 - Change out profile brick for a short profile brick

Item A.7.

DRB19-00453

Within the 500 through 700 block of West Pepper Place

Location:

Located on the north and south side of West Pepper Place, West of North Date. (4.2 ± acres)

Request:

Review of modifications to the approved two and three-story townhome elevations and landscape plan for a multiple residence development

Applicant:

Tristan Keski, Perlman Architects of Arizona, Inc., applicant

Staff Planner:

Lisa Davis, Planner II

Council District:

4

- ❖ Staff Planner, Lisa Davis, presented the case for an infill development. Modifications to elevations. Changes in the hardscape; colored concrete to stained concrete. Remodel will be completed in phases. Updating planter boxes, columns, roofing material, AC screen walls from original approved design.
- ❖ Applicant Tristan Keski, Perlman Architects, 4808 N 24th Street, Phoenix, AZ, stated that they are revising the design to reduce material costs. He explained that this is a mixed income development and they need to be cost conscious on remodel costs to keep the end cost marketable to limited income buyers.
- ❖ Boardmember Randy Carter:
 - Approves of changes
 - Keep fascia sizes consistent
 - One or the other roofing material, not a blend of material between roof and porch roof
 - Consider concrete roof tile
 - No issue concrete or planter changes
- ❖ Vice Chair J. Seth Placko:
 - Guardrail type rail from concrete wall
- ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompson:
 - No problem with design change
- ❖ Boardmember Sean Banda:
 - Likes the metal roof but it's being taken off
 - Metal speaks volumes
 - Some buildings with metal roof, some without; doesn't recommend changing roof covering from building to building
- ❖ Nana Appiah, PhD, AICP, Planning Director:

Explained that staff is looking for direction from the board. The Board then clarified they want consistency in roofing material between roof and porch coverings. The Board suggested that the applicant explore concrete roof tile on roof and porch roofs as an alternative.

- A. Call to Order
- B. Election of new Chair and Vice Chair
- ❖ Boardmember Sean Banda recommended and motioned to nominate Boardmember Randy Carter for the Chair position. Boardmember Scott Thomas seconded the motion.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Knudsen absent)
Upon tabulation of vote, if showed:
Ayes – Posten-Thompson, Placko, Thomas, Banda, Green, Carter
Nays – None
 - ❖ Chair Nicole Posten-Thompsons recommended and motioned to nominate Boardmember Scott Thomas for the Vice Chair position; Boardmember Randy Carter seconded the motion.

Vote: 6-0 (Boardmember Knudsen absent)
Upon tabulation of vote, if showed:
Ayes – Posten-Thompson, Placko, Thomas, Banda, Green, Carter
Nays – None
- C. Consider the Minutes from the June 11, 2019 meeting:
Boardmember Randy Carter motioned to approve the June 11, 2019 minutes. Boardmember Scott Thomas seconded the motion.
- D. Discuss and take action on the following Design Review case: None
- E. Other Business: None
- F. Adjournment:
Boardmember Scott Thomas motioned to adjourn, and Boardmember Tanner Green seconded the motion. Meeting adjourned at 7:08pm.

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644- 3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644- 2767.**